

National Transportation Safety Board
Washington, DC 20594

Brief of Accident

Adopted 03/26/2007

LAX06FA106B File No. 21116	02/08/2006	El Cajon, CA	Aircraft Reg No. N759KE	Time (Local): 16:42 PST	
Make/Model: Cessna / 182Q			Fatal	Serious	Minor/None
Engine Make/Model: Teledyne Continental / O-470-U			Crew 1	0	0
Aircraft Damage: Destroyed			Pass 0	0	0
Number of Engines: 1					
Operating Certificate(s): None					
Type of Flight Operation: Personal					
Reg. Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation					

Last Depart. Point: Same as Accident/Incident Location
Destination: San Diego, CA
Airport Proximity: Off Airport/Airstrip

Condition of Light: Day
Weather Info Src: Weather Observation Facility
Basic Weather: Visual Conditions
Lowest Ceiling: 20000 Ft. AGL, Broken
Visibility: 25.00 SM
Wind Dir/Speed: 260 / 008 Kts
Temperature (°C): 23
Precip/Obscuration: No Obscuration; No Precipitation

Pilot-in-Command Age: 68

Flight Time (Hours)

Certificate(s)/Rating(s)
Private; Single-engine Land
Instrument Ratings
None

Total All Aircraft: 322
Last 90 Days: 36
Total Make/Model: 233
Total Instrument Time: 34

A Cessna 182Q and a Cessna 172RG, were operating in class D airspace and departed from the same airport. The Cessna 172RG was operating under instrument flight rules as an instructional flight (IFR) and receiving radar service from an approach control facility, while the Cessna 182 was operating under visual flight rules (VFR) and had been released from communication with air traffic control. The pilot undergoing instruction in the Cessna 172RG was most likely wearing a view limiting device which tasked the certified flight instructor seated in the right seat to serve as both an instructor and a safety pilot. The Cessna 172RG departed first, performing a right 260-degree turn over the airport and was assigned a southwest heading by the controller. The Cessna 182Q departed to the west and made a left turn, while climbing in a southeasterly direction. The heading assigned to the Cessna 172RG put it on a direct collision course with the Cessna 182Q, with a collision angle of 40 degrees. Following a discussion with the controller about the pilot's intentions upon completion of an approach, the controller instructed the Cessna 172RG to fly heading 190. The pilot read back, "One nine" and no further transmissions were received from the Cessna 172RG. In class D airspace, there is no specified separation requirement between VFR and IFR aircraft. However, controllers still have a responsibility to be vigilant for potential collisions between aircraft under these circumstances. This accident occurred after the controllers in communication with the Cessna 172RG had received a sustained conflict alert involving the Cessna 172RG and Cessna 182Q (operating on a VFR transponder code), but failed to recognize or resolve the conflict. Comparisons of the calculated convergence angles of the two airplanes showed that for an 85th percentile male seated in the left seat (Cessna did not create pilot view angles for pilots seated in the front right seat), the Cessna 172RG pilot was about 15 degrees outside of the right view angle and the Cessna 182Q pilot was within about 6 degrees of the left view angle.

Brief of Accident (Continued)

LAX06FA106B

File No. 21116

02/08/2006

El Cajon, CA

Aircraft Reg No. N759KE

Time (Local): 16:42 PST

Occurrence #1: MIDAIR COLLISION
Phase of Operation: CLIMB - TO CRUISE

Findings

1. (C) VISUAL LOOKOUT - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND
 2. (C) VISUAL LOOKOUT - INADEQUATE - PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT
 3. (F) EXCESSIVE WORKLOAD (TASK OVERLOAD) - PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT
-

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER
Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

Findings

4. TERRAIN CONDITION - GROUND

Findings Legend: (C) = Cause, (F) = Factor

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident as follows.

The pilots of both airplanes failure to maintain an adequate visual lookout due to their relative flight paths, which limited the available visual cues. Factors were the failure of the air traffic controller(s) to issue a conflict alert to the Cessna 172RG after repeated visual and aural warnings of an impending collision and the task load of the certified flight instructor in the other airplane.